



Nepal Health Sector Support Programme III (NHSSP – III)

IMPACT ASSESSMENT OF HEALTH INFRASTRUCTURE POLICY DEVELOPMENT WORKSHOP

May 2018



Disclaimer

This material has been funded by UK aid from the UK government; however the views expressed do not necessarily reflect the UK government's official policies.

IMPACT ASSESSMENT OF HEALTH INFRASTRUCTURE POLICY DEVELOPMENT WORKSHOP

Submitted to:

Nepal Health Sector Support Programme (NHSSP- III)
Oasis Building, Lalitpur, Nepal

Submitted by:

Human Resource Development Centre (HURDEC Pvt. Ltd)
GPO Box – 158, Kathmandu
Tel: +977-1-5542684; 5541676
Email: hurdecnp@gmail.com
Lalitpur, Nepal

May 28, 2018

Table of Contents

1. Introduction	5
1.1 Context	5
1.2. Objectives	5
1.3. Approach and methodology	6
3. Findings of the assessment	7
3.1 Usefulness of workshop inputs	7
3.2 Specific measures taken after attending the workshop	7
3.3 Challenges in enforcing and / or amending health infrastructure policies .	8
4. Conclusion and Recommendations	9
Annex - A: Workshop on Health Infrastructure Policy Development	12
Annex - B: Workshop impact assessment checklist	13
Annex – C: List of respondents of the interview	14

1. Introduction

1.1 Context

The Nepal Health Sector Support Programme (NHSSP) is an initiative of the Nepal Ministry of Health (MoH) financed by the UK Department for International Development (DFID). The Capacity Enhancement Programme is part of the NHSSP's Health Infrastructure work stream, and aims to strengthen institutional capacity and transfer skills to management and staff in the MoH and Department of Urban Development & Building Construction (DUDBC), as well as share information and knowledge with private sector construction contractors and professionals.

The programme focuses on strengthening skills in three key areas:

- Policy development and evidence-based planning
- Health infrastructure technical skills
- Seismic retrofitting and rehabilitation, standards, and practice.

The main target groups for this programme are:

- MoH senior officials, and technical staff
- DUDBC technical staff at central and sub-national levels
- Private sector construction professionals (including engineers and architects)
- Private sector construction contractors
- 'Fresh' (newly qualified graduate) engineers, engineering teachers and students.

The NHSSP's Health Infrastructure team organised a Training Need Analysis (TNA) workshop in September 2017 to identify the capacity needs of selected target groups in policy development. Key issues identified in this exercise were then developed as training sessions in the Health Infrastructure Policy Development Workshop conducted in November 2017 (see Annex A for two-day Workshop Programme Schedule).

The workshop aimed to strengthen participants' skills and practice in developing appropriate policies, procedures and standards for high quality health infrastructure for effective health service delivery. Workshop participants included representatives from MoH, Department of Health Service (DoHS) and DUDBC, National Reconstruction Authority (NRA), and development partners German International Cooperation (GIZ) and United States Agency for International Development (USAID). To assess outcomes and effects of this activity, NHSSP contracted Human Resource Development Centre (HURDEC) to design, implement and report on the impact assessment of the workshop.

1.2. Objectives

The objectives of the impact assessment are to:

- Assess the level of improvement in participant understanding health infrastructure policies and standards

- Assess the relevance of content delivered during the programme in relation to policy formulation and implementation
- Identify specific measures taken by the participant after attending the workshop, (if any), in relation to formulation or application of health infrastructure policies
- Identify major challenges foreseen in formulation of policies and implementation
- Make recommendations to improve the NHSSP approach to health infrastructure capacity enhancement

1.3. Approach and methodology

The assessment focused on gathering and analysing feedback from the participants who participated for two full days in the workshop. These key informant interviews were conducted against a checklist of areas to provide information on the objectives. This is a qualitative approach, drawing on in-depth responses from each of the participants.

The impact assessment methodology comprised:

- **Document review** – The following documents and materials were reviewed to guide the process: Capacity Enhancement Programme Outline Design Report (July 2017), Training Needs Analysis Workshop Report (September 2017), Report on Health Infrastructure Policy Development Workshop (November 2017). , Presentation slides and material distributed in the Policy Development workshop were also reviewed.
- **Development of assessment tool/checklist** – The primary method of data collection was through key informant interviews, using a structured checklist developed in consultation with the NHSSP counterparts. The assessment checklist was based on the objectives and contents of the Policy Development workshop (see Annex B for the assessment checklist).
- **Selection of target participants** – Participants for face-to-face interview were selected in consultation with NHSSP counterparts. The respondents of the interview were drawn from MoH, NRA, DUDBC and DOHS. A total of eight participants and two resource persons were interviewed (see Annex C for list of respondents interviewed).
- **Key informants interview** – interviews were held with these participants, with findings analysed against the workshop and impact evaluation objectives.
- **Report preparation** – The evaluation report was compiled and submitted to NHSSP.

3. Findings of the assessment

Findings of the assessment are drawn from the interview notes based on the assessment objectives. The finding mainly focuses on:

- Usefulness of workshop inputs for developing effective health infrastructure policies;
- Actions taken to enforce and amend the existing health infrastructure policies;
- Major barriers in enforcing and amending health infrastructure policies
- Recommendations to improve the NHSSP approach to health infrastructure capacity enhancement

3.1 Usefulness of workshop inputs

The participants stated that the workshop inputs enhanced their capacity to understand the present federal government structure and the role and responsibility of all the three level of government. Such inputs also enhanced their level of confidence in bringing effectiveness in their roles and responsibilities related to health infrastructure policies. It also helped the participants to design activities, programmes and services to cater for their operational objectives and work plan.

As a result of the training input, participants were more aware about relevance and importance of Gender Equality and Social Inclusion (GESI) policies in the design and implementation of health infrastructure. Participants also identified the importance of reflecting aspects and requirements relating to gender, the elderly, and children as well those of differently-able citizens only.

The workshop also helped the participants to become more competent in assessing demands for the support of constructing Health Posts, Primary Health Care Centres, and Hospitals against policies and procedures for health infrastructure development.

Information transfer sessions were particularly welcomed – the explanation of and discussions on the Nepal Health Infrastructure Development Standards 2017 helped clarify aspects including the new guidelines for design and construction, maintenance norms, the strategy for health infrastructure development, and land selection criteria.

The workshop also helped the participants to reinforce their existing knowledge on technical aspects of design and construction of health infrastructures. As a result, they were more confident in performing their roles and responsibilities.

3.2 Specific measures taken after attending the workshop

The six-month period from the workshop in November 2017 to the evaluation in May 2018 did not afford too many major opportunities for participants to directly apply their newly-

acquired knowledge, although all the key informants anticipated that opportunities to do so would certainly arise in the future.

Despite this, participants were able to give specific examples where they had already been able to implement measures based on what they had learned in the workshop:

- MoH participants reported that the Ministry has subsequently adjusted requirements for land transfer. Previously, MoH would only support proposals from local government for the construction of health facilities if land had already been provided and transferred to make the site available. However, this has now been amended to a proposition where MoH will approve the proposal if the local government body provides the minute of meeting with their decision to provide that land for health post construction.
- Having a clearer understanding of health infrastructure policies has enabled participants to better apply these criteria and more effectively explain requirements to the communities or the health facility managements. This improvement in communication has led better understanding among the communities about health infrastructure policies. Wards have been able to revise their proposals in light of this information, and propose new sites in line with the guidelines. To illustrate, of 258 new project requests, only 186 are approved for implementation, with the communities involved now adjusting their proposals to take account of the new criteria.
- DUDBC participants reported that policy issues discussed as part of the workshop will be taken into account during the current process of reviewing and amending Guidelines for Design and Construction of Health Infrastructure.
- Similarly, the DUDBC role as the lead authority for design and construction of government buildings was raised in discussions at the workshop. This issue is now being followed up in various government forums with a view to reinforcing and re-committing to this mandate.

3.3 Challenges in enforcing and / or amending health infrastructure policies

Respondents identified a range of challenges relating to the enforcement and / or amending health infrastructure policies. While some aspects require specific improvements in management or inter-department coordination, a significant number relate to information requirements of the government structures established under the new federal system. This suggests that the NHSSP Capacity Enhancement Programme needs to consider approaches to disseminating information to this wider audience.

The main challenges highlighted include:

- The need to coordinate different agencies at national, district and local government level to identify and release sites for health infrastructure development. The transfer of forest land was cited as a significant problem. Slow acquisition and approval processes (which requiring approvals from the Council of Ministers of the federal government) were also identified as hampering development.
- There is a significant gap in capacity in newly-formed structures at provincial and local government level. Although budgets for health infrastructure will be transferred to this bodies, they have yet to develop and adopt operating guidelines and standards. Similarly, they lack the numbers of technical staff required for developing and upgrading health infrastructure. This gap should be addressed in a coordinated fashion – reliance on the central agencies must be reduced by the gradual capacitation and transfer of activities to sub-national structures.
- While activities such as the policy development workshop assist in disseminating information, there are still gaps in building a common understanding of such polices and guidelines among the stakeholders in DUDBC, MoH, NRA, provincial and local governments, and the private sector.
- GESI policies and requirements are not widely understood or implemented in a sensitive fashion by contractors, local leaders, and local authorities.

4. Conclusion and Recommendations

4.1 Conclusion

The Impact Assessment of the Health Infrastructure Policy Development Workshop conducted in November 2017 shows that participants have benefitted from the training, that their awareness of key issues has improved, and that they have found opportunities to apply this new knowledge, and also anticipating doing so in the future.

The officials that participated in the workshop from different organisations have confirmed that the learning from the workshop enhanced their capacity to perform their job and bring improvements in health infrastructure development.

The need for capacity enhancement under the new federal arrangements was recently emphasised by Provincial Ministers. The MoH held a planning and consultation session with provincial structures in March 2018 to prepare for the health plan and budget for Fiscal Year 2018-19. The majority of Provincial Ministers highlighted capacity gaps in their departments, and requested support in preparing the required policies and guidelines, including health infrastructure.

The Impact Assessment exercise also drew on responses from the key informants, which taking account of the programme's current operating context, highlights opportunities to improve NHSSP provision and performance in health infrastructure capacity enhancement. These are set out in Section 4.2 Recommendations below.

4.2 Recommendations to improve the NHSSP work stream on health infrastructure capacity enhancement

Content and target groups

The NHSSP Capacity Enhancement Programme should:

- Continue to support and promote the widespread dissemination of information on health infrastructure development policies and guidelines to relevant stakeholders, including relevant staff and representatives from MoH, DUDBC, NRA, provincial and local government, private sector construction professionals and contractors.
- Promote effective monitoring and evaluation (approaches, tools and procedures) as an integral part of training on health infrastructure development policies and guidelines. Attention should be paid to the role and capacity of health project monitoring teams as a specific target group.
- Develop and implement a capacity enhancement workshop on procurement policy and procedures for those who are involved in procurement processes for health infrastructure development, including contractors, engineers, architects and provincial and local government officials.
- Target technical staff of DUDBC, MoH, provincial and local government, as well as construction professionals and contractors, to ensure consistent understanding of and response to health infrastructure designs and norms.
- Disseminate information to local leaders, including the elected government representatives, to orient them on health infrastructure and medical services provision, health infrastructure planning, as well as operations and maintenance.
- Support DUDBC in responding to the transition of design and construction process to sub-national level by capacity enhancement of the institution and technical staff training.

Capacity enhancement activities

The NHSSP Capacity Enhancement Programme should:

- Engage with target organisations and counterparts to ensure that the right type of participants should be selected for training activities. Consistent participation from specific target groups is essential in building institutional knowledge and effective community of practice.
- Institute an action planning session at the end of each capacity building activity to help participants identify action and learning points to be applied in their work. This will build responsibility among participants themselves to implement and review the action plan, as well as increasing impact and effectiveness. Impact assessment processes could include review of these action plans.

**Annex - A: Workshop on Health Infrastructure Policy Development
Programme Schedule**

	Time	Session	Outline	Facilitators
Day 1	10:00-10:15	Registration and Tea		
	10:15-10:30	Inaugural		
	10:40-12:10	Session-I	Theme: 1, Public Policy and Governance <i>A. Introduction to Public Policy</i>	Narayan Gopal Malego, Trilochan Pokharel, Rajendra Adhikari
	12:10-1:00	Lunch		
	1:00-2:30	Session II	Theme: 1, Public Policy and Governance <i>B. Gender Equality and Social Inclusion</i>	Sitaram Prasai, Sunil Khadka
	2:30-2:45	Tea Break		
	2:45-4:15	Session III	Theme: 1, Public Policy and Governance <i>C. Governance in context of federalism</i>	Balananda Poudel
	Day 2	10:00-10:15	Recap of Day 1	
10:15-11:45		Session I	Theme: 2, Stocktaking of Policies and Guiding Instruments in Health Infrastructure Development-I <i>A. Existing policies and gaps</i>	Sunil Khadka, Mohan Das Manandhar, Sudip Pokharel & Gyanendra Shakya
11:45-1:15		Session II	Theme: 2, Stocktaking of Policies and Guiding Instruments in Health Infrastructure Development-I <i>B. Key external policies and partners</i>	
1:15-2:00		Lunch		
2:00-3:30		Session III	Theme: 3, Sustainable and Safer Health Infrastructures	Santosh Shrestha, Sunil Khadka & Gyanendra Shakya
3:45-4:15		Way forward, Certification and Closing followed by Hi-tea		

Annex - B: Workshop impact assessment checklist

- A. Name of respondent
- B. Organisation
- C. Designation
- D. The interviewer (consultant) will brief about the impact assessment

1. How relevant and useful were the workshop inputs in relation to policy formulation and implementation on:

- Land acquisition
- Site selection
- Repair and maintenance
- Approval of drawings and designs
- Federal structure
- Gender and social inclusion

2. What are the specific measures (if any) taken after attending the workshop in relation to formulation of overall infrastructure development policies in health sector?

3. What are the barriers in formulation and enforcement of infrastructure development policies and guidelines in the health sector?

4. To further enhance the capacity of stakeholders in formulating and enforcement of infrastructure development policies, what could be the interventions/inputs to the concerned stakeholders?

Annex – C: List of respondents of the interview

A. List of participants

SN	Name	Section/Organization	Designation
1	Mr. Pranaya Upadhyay	MoH/PCU	Public Health Administrator (PHA)
2	Mr. Himel KC	DUDBC	Senior Divisional Engineer
3	Mr. Mani Ram Gelal	DUDBC	Deputy Director General
4	Mr. Surya Bahadur Khadka	DOHS/PHCRD	Statistician Officer
5	Ms. Renu Maharjan	MoH/PCU	SDE Architect
6	Mr. Sushil Prasad Nepal	DOHS/MD	Computer Officer
7	Mr. Raju Man Manandhar	National Reconstruction Authority (NRA)	Joint Secretary
8	Mr. Uddhab Poudel	UNICEF	Engineer Coordinator

B. List of resource persons

SN	Name	Section/Organization	Designation
1	Mr. Sitaram Prasai	NHSSP	Senior GESI Advisor
2	Mr. Rajendra Adhikari	NASC	Director

C. List of officials met in NHSSP

SN	Name	Section/Organization	Designation
1	Mr. Sunil Khadka	NHSSP	Lead Advisor
2	Mr. Ganesh Ram Nhamafuki	NHSSP	Capacity Enhancement Advisor
3	Mr. Santosh Shrestha	NHSSP	Senior Earthquake Resilience Advisor
4	Mr. Gyanendra Shakya	NHSSP	Senior Architect